

Coding Manual for Thematic Analysis of Humility, Truth, and Faith
Anne Colby and William Damon
7/16/12

Humility

Themes

1. Identification with lower-status perspectives

Tendency to see things (including self and/or world) from the perspective of those who are disadvantaged, powerless, not as privileged or exalted as the self; solidarity or identification with less privileged people; references to the wisdom of and desire to learn from those from more humble backgrounds; stated conviction that all people, even those from modest circumstances, have the potential to make important contributions or to lead a life of purpose or sanctity.

I'll never forget that sight. Mrs. Roosevelt, tall, lovely, gracious, shaking each work-hardened hand and bending her head to catch what each man said....

[Pope John Paul II comment about men he worked with in the mine] I was able to observe their deep but quiet religiosity and their great wisdom about life.

[Nelson Mandela] I was really very nervous...I didn't know politics, you see? I was backward politically and I was dealing with chaps, you see, who knew politics, who could discuss what was happening inside and outside South Africa. Chaps, some of whom had very little education, academically very humble qualifications, but they knew *far* more than I did. My friend knew far more than I did because he learned not only just the facts, he was able to get *behind* the facts and explain to you the causes for a particular viewpoint.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] was courteous and attentive to every individual no matter what his or her status. At parties, he spent most of his time talking to maids, gardeners, domestic staff. At formal events, he always shook hands with the staff.

[Biographer comment on Jane Addams]A commitment to arrangements in which the privileged would live and work with the poor as their social equals was at the center of [Jane Addams's] work.

[Pope John Paul II] Sanctity and vocational commitment are available for everyone; everyone is called to holiness.

[Nelson Mandela] In judging our progress as individuals we tend to concentrate on external factors such as one's social position, influence and popularity, wealth and standard of education. These are, of course, important in measuring one's success in material matters and it is perfectly understandable if many people exert themselves mainly to achieve all these. But internal factors may be even more crucial in assessing one's development as a human being. Honesty, sincerity,

simplicity, humility, pure generosity, absence of vanity , readiness to serve others - qualities which are within easy reach of every soul - are the foundation of one's spiritual life.

2. Commitment to simplicity; recognition that one is an ordinary person

Refusal to accept the trappings of privilege, special status, and so on; stated commitment to simplicity or austerity; use of rituals that symbolize simplicity and humility; stated belief that being appointed to a high level position doesn't make you special, doesn't change the fact that you're still the same person you were before.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] maintained a frugal lifestyle. He had the use of two grand state mansions ... but whenever possible he preferred to stay at his comfortable suburban house ... where 3 of his grandchildren and a young relative lived with him. He liked to get away from the formality of official residences. He donated 1/3 of his salary to a children's charity he had set up. Much of his other income was also given to charity or to [his political party]. Accustomed to a life of austerity, he wanted to set a new style of leadership, free from the greed and corruption for which the party had been known. "We are not going to live as fat cats."

[Eleanor Roosevelt] was known for the simplicity of her dress, manner, and surroundings and for not wanting special treatment from others.

[Biographer comment on Eleanor Roosevelt's] From her first days in the White House, this desire to remain part of the public propelled her agenda. She, more often than not, greeted guests at the door herself; learned to operate the elevator; and adamantly refused Secret Service protection.

[Biographer comment on Pope John Paul II] He lived simply, by deliberate choice. He had neither a bank account nor personal funds, his needs being met by the archdiocese. If a priest or parishioner gave him a gift of money during a parish visitation, he wouldn't even open the envelope, but gave it away the same day to someone in need.

[Biographer comment on Hammarskjöld] [In talking to reporters right after his appointment as Secretary General of the United Nations, Dag Hammarskjöld commented that] personal views of mine are not or should not be of any greater interest to you today than ... a couple of weeks ago.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] enjoyed the fame but remained unmoved by it and became increasingly conscious of the gap between his public image and the ordinary man he felt himself to be.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] Followers viewed his era as a golden age of hope and harmony. They missed his radiant smile, his self-deprecating humor, his benign presence, indeed the touch of magic he brought to everyday life. [Mandela], however, preferred a simple verdict on his own career – I was not a messiah, but an ordinary man who had become a leader because of extraordinary circumstances.

3. Humorous perspective on the self

Humorous or ironic perspective on the self, revealing that leader doesn't take himself/herself too seriously.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] When he remarried [late in life], his wife (known for her strong views) said that she had no intention of changing her name. Mandela said – I don't plan to change mine either.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] He once referred to his political opponents as Mickey Mouse organizations, prompting them to retort that he ran a Goofy government. But when the political opponent was ill, leader went to the hospital to visit him, alerting the patient to his presence outside the door by saying loudly: "Hello Mickey Mouse, this is Goofy. Can I come in?"

[Biographer comment on Pope John Paul II], dealing with new physical realities of hip replacement, had a hard time at first, then began being humorous with his cane.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] From reading his writings, one has almost an impression of great seriousness, but his friends report plenty of laughter shared with him, too, even at the most difficult times. In particular, there was merriment over the lively theological arguments ... One such debate was brought to an end by [a friend], to roars of laughter from those listening, by using his sparring partner's [Bonhoeffer's] own favorite expressions....

4. Understanding the self as part of a team

References to the limits on what any one person can achieve working alone; to the idea that even strong and effective leaders are working as part of a team; although accepting the responsibilities of leadership, evidence that leader doesn't set him or herself above the rest of the team; comments that strength comes from being part of a community, working together.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] He minimized his own importance in government, emphasizing the talent and ability of his cabinet colleagues. "Many of my colleagues are head and shoulders above me in almost every respect. Rather than being an asset, I'm more of a decoration."

[Eleanor Roosevelt] I have no illusions that anyone can change the world in a short time... Yet I do believe that even a few people, who want to understand, to help and to do the right thing for the great numbers of people instead of the few can help.

[Dag Hammarskjöld] [Speaking to volunteers] You and I are in the same boat together.

[Mandela] What has sustained me even in the most grim moments is the knowledge that I am a member of a tried and tested family [of collaborators] which has triumphed over many difficulties. In such a large and broad family, opinions can be diverse on almost everything, but we have always succeeded in sorting out things together and going forward all the same. This fact endows my spirits with powerful wings.

5. Belief in service-oriented leadership or leadership that is informed by criticism

Statements that humility is critical to good leadership; that leadership is more about service than about power; that leaders need to welcome criticism.

[Dag Hammarskjold] The public servant is there to assist those who take the decisions that frame history; a leader is an instrument, catalyst, perhaps an inspirer – he serves.

[Dag Hammarskjold] I feel that an administration inspired by sound self criticism never blunted by conceit or false loyalties, and self-improving in that spirit, has a just claim to respect and confidence

[Dag Hammarskjold] I am here to serve you all. .. It is for you to correct me if I fail.

[Mandela][Two close colleagues/friends of mine] share one common feature which forms an essential part of our friendship and which I value very much - they never hesitate to criticize me for my mistakes and throughout my political career have served as a mirror through which I can see myself.

6. *Explicit statements about the importance of humility or about the dangers of its absence.* Direct references to humility as an important value, which plays a key role in perceptions of people, organizations, nations, and the like; explication of human problems caused by lack of humility; demonstrated awareness of moral risk posed by ego and efforts made to deal with that risk; comments about the importance of people setting aside ego for the sake of spiritual connection or growth, critiques of the ethic of benevolence as condescending and disrespectful toward recipients.

[Bonhoeffer] I as a Christian see the main guilt of Germany [in WWI] in quite a different light. I see it in Germany's complacency, in her belief in her almightiness, in the lack of humility and faith in God and fear of God.

[Heschel] Freedom is the liberation from the tyranny of the self-centered ego. ... transcending the self The austere discipline of unremitting inquiry and self-criticism are acts of liberating man from the routine way of looking only at those features of experience which are familiar and regular and open his soul to the unique and transcendent.

[Heschel] The shock of radical amazement, the humility born in awe and reverence, the austere discipline of unremitting inquiry and self-criticism are acts of liberating man from the routine way of looking only at those features of experience which are familiar and regular and open his soul to the unique and transcendent.

[Eleanor Roosevelt] If we do not allow our high American officials and their families to live a usual American life, I wonder how long we will really have a representative type of American in official life?

[Biographer comment on Pope JPII] [Karol Wojtyla calling for humility on being named as Pope John Paul II] The message was unmistakable. Discipleship came before authority, and sanctity came before power...

[Addams] To give up the consciousness of one's own identity and achievements is perhaps the hardest demand which life can make upon us, but certainly those who call themselves Christian ... should be ready to meet this demand.

[Biographer comment on Addams] In time, she came to reject the ethic of benevolence, seeing it as selfish, arrogant, anti-democratic.

7. Reluctance to pass judgment on others

Evidence of reluctance to pass judgment on others, especially in simplistic or moralistic terms.

[Dag Hammarskjöld] Let us not get caught in the belief that divisions of our world between the righteous and the wrong-doers, between idealism and materialism, between freedom and slavery, coincide with national boundaries. The righteous are to be found everywhere, as are the wrong doers. ...

[Mandela] I was twenty-one then, and my subsequent association with the ANC and progressive ideas helped me to crawl out of the prejudice of my youth and to accept all people as equals. I came to accept that I have no right whatsoever to judge others in terms of my own customs, however much I may be proud of such customs; that to despise others because they have not observed particular customs is a dangerous form of chauvinism.

[Biographer comment on Addams] It was important to Jane Addams that the group could lead a life of upright purpose yet avoid the unappealing aspects of moral earnestness.

8. Use of historical, cosmic, or other "big picture" frames of reference to provide a modest perspective on the self

References to bringing a historical, cosmic, or other "big picture" sense of perspective to the self and one's achievements, expressing the view that any one person, no matter how seemingly important in his or her time, is playing only a small part in a much larger, longer story. Do not code here the claim that one is a figure of great historical importance or that one's work constitutes a turning point in history.

[Heschel] It's always important to look at things from horizons that range beyond the span of an individual life or even life of a nation.

[Hammarskjöld] ... the strong sense of proportion of a man seeing his own time in the long perspective of history.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] His aristocracy was unmistakable, yet not obtrusive, chiefly owing to his boundless curiosity about every new environment in which he found himself and to his irresistible and unflinching sense of humor ... and the capacity to see oneself and the world from a perspective other than one's own.

[Biographer comment on Addams] Jane Addams's reflections toward the end of her life showed her feeling of being part of a larger whole. Her life was only a chapter in some longer book, she was saying, and there were many more chapters to be written.

9. Counter indicator – *Evidence of narcissism, self-centeredness, grandiosity, dismissive or defensive response to criticism, and/or sense of superiority*

Evidence of egoism, self-centeredness, narcissism, excessive self-regard, grandiosity, dismissive or defensive response to criticism, and/or sense of superiority to peers. Coder should note life stage to which this counter-indicator is observed to apply.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] As a young man, Bonhoeffer was known as very highly cultured; he seemed to look down on frivolity.

[Hammar skjold's] faith was constantly at struggle ... risks of returning to chaos and ever threatening self-centeredness.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] Some pointed to his imperiousness [as a young man]. People tried to persuade him to adopt a less lofty manner in public. But he was an aristocrat – aloof, arrogant, regal.

10. Counter-indicator – *Overly demanding and/or controlling behavior*

Evidence that the leader was unreasonably demanding or controlling with others; judgmental; lacking in generosity toward others' failings; intemperate; or authoritarian. Coder should note life stage to which this counter-indicator is observed to apply.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] He was known for his discipline, even a kind of tyrannical nature in the moral demands he made on others.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] His moral passion sometimes makes him seem judgmental – makes strong moral demands on people (as well as on himself). This quality also led sometimes to intemperate public language (to the press, especially) which did not serve him well.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] His nature was not always benign. He was feared as well as revered. He tended to be autocratic at times or to wield his massive authority unwisely.

11. Counter-indicator – *Severe self-criticism for not meeting extremely high standards*

Evidence of a tendency to set extremely high, unrealistic standards for oneself, including those that demand humility and other virtues; and a tendency to indulge in very severe and sustained self-criticism when standards are not met. Coder should note life stage to which this counter-indicator is observed to apply.

[Biographer comment on Hammar skjold] His confessions show how deeply he experienced existence as meaningless at times, how intensely he felt the loneliness of alienation He persisted in ruthless self criticism.

[Biographer comment on Addams] Jane Addams was immersed in great self-recrimination for her self-absorption. [At a young age – before starting her life's work.]

Truthfulness/Inner truthfulness

Themes

1. Evidence that leader acts according to convictions even under pressure

Evidence that leader is true to the self and self's convictions, even in the face of pressure to do otherwise; consistency between words and deeds in the face of significant challenges.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] When Mandela landed at Robben Island [South Africa's most brutal prison], he was ordered to run but refused and walked at a leisurely pace. The warders yelled, "Look man, we will kill you, we are not fooling around. Your wives and children and mothers and father will never know what happened to you. This is the last warning." Leader calmly replied, "You have your duty and we have ours."

[Biographer comment on Roosevelt] Eleanor Roosevelt had the courage to live up to her beliefs, even in the face of death threats.

[Bishop of Canterbury comment on Bonhoeffer] He was crystal clear in his convictions and, young as he was, humble-minded as he was, he saw the truth and spoke it with complete absence of fear.

[Biographer comment on Hammarskjöld] In times of difficulty, Hammarskjöld was sustained and inspired by pure and firmly founded beliefs and ideals about life and human relationships to which he was true in word and act.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] [In the trial, when it seemed clear they would get death sentence] Mandela showed no concern for his own position... his aim was to turn the trial into a showcase against the government. It was this quality of leadership, of standing firm in adversity, of accepting a greater responsibility ..., maintaining dignity and confidence in the face of the death sentence that was to leave its mark on the trial. He wanted to use the trial not to try to get less punishment but for proclaiming his views and the reasons for them. ... He regarded whatever sentence he received as being of secondary importance to the need for public understanding of the conspirators' beliefs. ... Leader then said that, if convicted, he would not appeal. He and colleagues felt an appeal would undermine the moral stand they had taken.

[Biographer comment on Addams] That her view was unpopular carried no weight with her.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] Young as he was, humble-minded as he was, Bonhoeffer saw the truth and spoke it with complete absence of fear. ... He was both self-confident and modest.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] Under the direst circumstances [his impending execution], Bonhoeffer was all humility and sweetness – atmosphere of happiness, joy in every smallest event ... his soul really shone.

2. Evidence that leader carefully considers the beliefs of groups that he/she belongs to or considers joining.

Evidence that leader makes careful assessment of what groups, organizations, or activities stand for, not joining them or withdrawing from them if he/she can't fully endorse what they stand for.

[Biographer comment on Roosevelt] thought carefully about the support she gave to different groups, and on two occasions she withdrew from organizations when she disagreed with their policies. She resigned from the Daughters of the American Revolution in 1939 when they barred the world-renowned contralto Marian Anderson from singing at Constitution Hall because she was African American.

[Biographer comment on Addams] She had resigned from the National Woman Suffrage Association board in 1914 because she objected to its endorsement of a states' rights suffrage amendment once she understood its racist implications.

3. Candid appraisal of the world as it is as part of any effort to improve it.

Leader emphasizes that, when trying to work for peace, justice, social change, it is important to look honestly at the world the way it is and to start from there, no matter how ambitious and determined to achieve goals he/she may be.

[Dag Hammarskjold] When trying to change our world, we have to face it as it is.

[Mandela] ... the moral was "Don't run away from your problems; face them! Because if you don't deal with them, they will always be with you. Deal with a problem which arises; face it courageously. That was the moral ... I never forgot that, you see, and I accepted that if you have a problem, you must face it and not gloss over it. For example, you know, in politics, there are very sensitive issues and people normally don't want an unpopular approach. If people say 'We must go on an action', very few people will say 'Have we got the resources? Have we made sufficient preparations? Are we in a position to undertake this action?' Some people like to give an impression of being militant and therefore not to face the problems, especially if they are the type of problems which are going to make you unpopular.

[Biographer comment on Addams] Reality – good or bad – never failed to compel her attention.

[Biographer comment on Addams] Emily Greene Balch praised [Addams's] love of life, of life as it is, not only as it might be.

[Biographer comment on Addams] Jane Addams was able to imagine new possibilities while also seeing life as it is, to create a bridge between those things we desire and those things which are possible.

4. Leader asserts the critical importance of truth as a central value in public life; explicit reflections on truth as a key value

Leader emphasizes the importance of truth (and other moral ideals) as a key value in public life; argues that truth is a centrally important political and cultural value; stresses the importance of publicly expressing truth; articulates the connections between truth and

freedom as public values; emphasizes the importance of the honesty and impartiality of public institutions and public servants as crucial to their credibility and effectiveness.

[Mandela] Truth often turns out to be divisive. Reconciliation ... is not about pretending that things were other than they were. No genuine reconciliation is possible without truth.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] Abraham Heschel was a social critic – he wrote about the importance of speaking out about the truth about the country as he saw it. He was calling people to account, was a critic of consumer society. Critic of the country’s treatment of the elderly He was a critic of public callousness. For the sake of truth and compassion, he jeopardized his health, compromised his writing and teaching, and undermined his prestige within the community Part of his outrage about the Vietnam War was his belief that the government was systematically lying to the American people and that this kind of falsehood, deception lies at the root of evil. ... For Heschel, public life must advance truth, personal integrity, and the divine vision of justice and compassion.

[Biographer comment on JP II] Pope John Paul II spoke about the link between truth and freedom; ... truth makes us free...enables us to work towards goal of freedom, which is happiness.

[JP II] Freedom is freedom *for*, not simply freedom *against*. And what freedom is *for* is truth. It is only by living in the truth that the human person is set free.

[Biographer comment on JP II] For Pope John Paul II, the ideal is the witness, a life coinciding with the truth. That is how he understands his pontifical service.

[Hammarskjöld] We would lack in historical sense ... if we were to believe that ideals we believe should dominate our own society will survive without an honest and continued fight for their supremacy in our own public life.

[Hammarskjöld] The weight we carry [our credibility]... is based solely on *trust in our impartiality*, our experience and knowledge, and our maturity of judgment. There was never a time when the troubles of the world were brought more quickly into every home but how rarely in a spirit of objectivity. How rarely in such a way as to make it possible for the common man to find what should be his proper reaction to world affairs in the light of his basic ideals.

[Bonhoeffer] [Letter from Bonhoeffer urging friend to stand firm against Hitler] – If we are untrue to ourselves in any way at this point, we shall discredit the entire struggle.

The remaining positive truth themes intersect with humility and/or faith.

5. Open-mindedness; determination to uphold true convictions while maintaining an open mind toward others’ views

References to the importance of open-minded consideration of views different from your own; belief that, even if you have strong convictions, you need to seriously consider perspectives different from your own; stresses the importance of really listening to people with range of views; sees open mindedness and humility about one’s own beliefs as

important to communication across religious, cultural, national, generational, or other differences. Leader may also argue that it is important to be able to maintain one's convictions and avoid a relativistic stance toward moral truth while also giving sincere and open-minded consideration to others' perspectives.

[Heschel] ... the most significant basis for meeting men of different religious traditions is the level of fear and trembling, of humility and contrition, where our individual moments of faith are mere waves in the endless ocean of mankind's reaching out for God, where all formulations and articulations appear as understatement, where our souls are swept away by the awareness of the urgency of answering God's commandment, while stripped of pretension and conceit we sense the tragic insufficiency of human faith. We need to foster the spiritual companionship of humility and contrition, open mindedness, as a precondition for interfaith dialogue.

[Biographer comment on Roosevelt] As labor's internal problems were intensifying, Eleanor Roosevelt responded as she always did: by listening to what the opposing parties had to say....

[Biographer comment on Roosevelt] Aware of how difficult it was for a politician and his staff to face unpopular decisions, Mrs. Roosevelt championed the appointment of individuals who had the nerve to disagree with FDR upfront.

[Roosevelt] We cannot settle strikes by refusing to understand their causes, we cannot prepare for a peaceful world unless we give proof of our self-restraint, of open-mindedness, of courage to do right at home..."

[Biographer comment on JPII] He was noted for his openness to new ideas and criticism as archbishop, willingness to live with pluralism.

[Hammarskjold] In thinking about international service, how to achieve unity (which might seem to require being empty of personal convictions) while also being true to our ideals – these should be those that we can endorse after having opened our minds, with great honesty, to the many voices of the world, ... to represent frankly what survives or emerges as one's own after such a test; ... let those ideals reach maturity and fruition in a universal climate. ... It will not permit us to live lazily under the protection of inherited and conventional ideas.

[Hammarskjold] Even working in an international organization that requires taking seriously very different points of view, one has the same obligation to be faithful to truth as he understands it.

[Biographer comment on Addams] Jane Addams was reluctant to join the lobbying campaign due to her broad-mindedness. She was eager to understand the issues from everybody's point of view.

6. Taking full responsibility for one's mistakes and limitations; willingness to admit and learn from mistakes; self-critical about one's humility or ability to live up to principles.

Leader shows a willingness to admit and learn from mistakes; a tendency to question or criticize oneself for failing to live up to principles or ideals or for being self-serving or

lacking in humility; recognizing, acknowledging, and working within one's limitations, revealing a commitment to honesty with oneself. Recognizes the dangers of self-deception.

[Biographer comment on Hammarskjöld] This demand of service in complete self-oblivion provoked in him a perpetual self-critique. He fought self-centeredness in all its shapes.

[Mandela] There is a stage in the life of every social reformer when he will thunder on platforms primarily to relieve himself of the scraps of undigested information that he has accumulated in his head; an attempt to impress the crowds rather than to start a calm and simple exposition of principles and ideas whose universal truth is made evident by personal experience and deeper study. In this regard I am no exception and I have been victim of the weakness of my own generation not once but a hundred times. I must be frank and tell you that when I look back at some of my early writings and speeches I am appalled by their pedantry, artificiality and lack of originality. The urge to impress and advertise is clearly noticeable.

[Bonhoeffer] I had been my own master, wild and undisciplined. I know that what I was doing then was using the cause of Jesus Christ for my own advantage, and being terribly vain about it. I pray God it never happens again. ... For all my loneliness, I was rather pleased with myself.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] He supports a confession of guilt (by the church for not opposing the war strongly enough) without a sidelong glance at the others who are also guilty.

[Biographer comment on JPII] In 1966 – in preparation for Poland celebrating the millennium of its Christianity–letters of invitation went to bishops of many countries. The one to the German bishops acknowledged the suffering of Poles at the hands of the Germans, but also said Germans had, at times, suffered at the hands of the Poles. The letter ended, “We forgive, and we ask your forgiveness.”

[Mandela in reference to his lack of attention to HIV while president] “At least I am willing to admit when I’ve made a mistake.” [Then his commitment to work toward correcting that mistake] led to vicious attacks on him but he kept on it. Eventually, his moral voice made change in the policy (regarding HIV) inevitable.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] When leader decided to leave the country to avoid conscription, he felt like he was running away – his diary reveals self reproach because of this decision. He questions whether that decision was a sign of inner dishonesty or self deception.

[Heschel] “Nothing is easier than to deceive oneself. As the mind grows sophisticated, self-deception advances. ... Who can trust his own motivations? His honesty? Who can be sure whether he is worshiping his own ego or an idol while ostensibly adoring god?”

[Mandela] Errors are inherent in political action. Those who are in the centre of the political struggle, who have to deal with practical and pressing problems, are afforded little time for reflection and no precedents to guide them and are bound to slip up many times. But in due course, and provided they are flexible and prepared to examine their work self-critically, they will acquire the necessary experience and foresight that will enable them to avoid the ordinary pitfalls and pick out their way ahead amidst the throb of events.

7. Awareness of limits of one's knowledge and understanding

References to the impossibility of completeness of knowledge or understanding; human finitude; or the limits of the human capacity to fully know reality or to fully know God.

[Heschel] ... the answers are questions in disguise, every new answer giving rise to new questions; the tree of knowledge grows upon the soil of mystery; wonder does not come to an end when knowledge is acquired.

[Roosevelt] On appointment to UN position, “this is an honor and responsibility...life is a constant education.”

8. Leader refers to ultimate truth as grounded in faith, religion, the gospel, or spirituality

[Bonhoeffer] For me, there is one truth, the pure truth of the gospel.

[Heschel] God-centered reality is the ultimate truth.

[JPII] Christ-centered hope is the truth of the world.

[JPII] The main job of the church is to bear witness to the truth of Christ. The presentation of truths may be adapted to meet the needs of different times, but the basic truth stays the same. The church is the custodian of a body of truths. Leader saw his job not as creating new “truths” out of his own ideas, but guarding the truths of the tradition as handed down over the years. Therefore, there needed to be boundaries...but also “no boundaries to the charity with which the Church proposed the truths...”

9. Counter-indicator – Evidence of rationalization, explaining away mistakes illegitimately, and/or discrepancies between ideals and actions; evidence that leader is oblivious to discrepancies between ideals and actions.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] Through an excess of loyalty, leader sometimes ignored or tried to explain away the corruption and other serious mistakes of those close to him.

10. Counter-indicator – Self-denunciation so intense that it becomes immobilizing, leading to demoralization, defeat, withdrawal from challenge

[Biographer comment on Addams] She saw her illness as ... a moral defeat. Later that year, she recorded in her commonplace book of quotations a comment she had heard in a sermon:

“Strength to begin a life of self-sacrifice without strength enough to carry on, makes one lead a life of duplicity and falsehood.” Believing that she lacked the goodness of character to be truly self-denying, she saw in her illness the likelihood of a lifetime of failure.

[Biographer comment on Hammarskjöld] This demand of service in complete self-oblivion provoked in Hammarskjöld a perpetual self-critique. ... He accuses himself of solipsism, greed for power, pettiness, the desire to keep himself well to the fore, of being joyless...

Hammar skjold's confessions show how deeply he experienced existence as meaningless, how intensely he felt the loneliness of alienation He persisted in ruthless self criticism.

Faith

Themes

1. Attempt to live at the intersection of the transcendent and the human

Evidence that leader seeks to live at the intersection of the transcendent (other-worldly, holy, or supernatural) and the human (this-worldly or earthly). Recognition of the importance of combining contemplation, reverence, or communion with God with action, pursuit of justice, peace, ethics, and human welfare.

[Bonhoeffer] I am looking for the place between the ultimate and penultimate (this world and God).

[Bonhoeffer] We need to stay in touch with this-worldliness [as well as other-worldliness]. It is only by living completely in this world that one learns to have faith.

[Bonhoeffer] There should be no attempt to keep God within bounds as a private or personal God. The church is going in the wrong direction to focus on private, petty sins. It is not the sins of weakness but the sins of strength that matter.

[Bonhoeffer] We can be Christians today in only two ways, through prayer and in doing justice among human beings. We can be born anew out of that prayer and action.

[Heschel] ... the human and the ultimate, the natural and the holy, enter a lasting covenant ...

[Heschel] To sense in the small things ... the ultimate in the common and simple. ... to feel in the rush of the passing the stillness of the eternal.

[Biographer comment on Heschel]... the astonishing unity of his own life ... the contemplative and the active, the mystic and the ethicist Wonder ... not turn away (as some mystics do) but rather being open in a new way to every aspect of experience.

[Heschel] ...the answer to evil is not the good but the holy. It is an attempt to raise human beings to a higher level of existence where we are not alone when confronted by evil. Our ability to overcome evil comes through the power of love and holiness given us by god. Our deeds are the divine in disguise.

[Biographer comment on Hammarskjöld] Eternity for him is to be experienced in the midst of this life.

2. Reference to Christ, Christianity, Christian love, or God or the prophets in the Hebrew Bible, as models of the right way to live or as criteria against which to evaluate judgments, actions, or beliefs.

Leader refers to Christ and Christianity or to key values of Christianity such as Christian love, or God and the prophets in the Hebrew Bible, or important Jewish values, as ethical guides and exemplars of the right way to live; for Christians, the Sermon on the Mount used as a guide; refers to Judeo-Christian faith tradition as a way to try to be a better person, or as a way to work toward overcoming evil in the world.

[Bonhoeffer] How do I live a Christian life in the real world and where are the ultimate authorities for such a life – the only life worth living? ... I believe the Bible alone is the answer.

[Bonhoeffer] Our community must be guided by uncompromising discipleship. The Sermon on Mount is the source for this.

[Heschel] I could not control my mean leanings without a belief in God.

[Heschel] God is not only the object of knowledge, he is the example one is to follow.

[Heschel] The answer to evil is not the good but the holy. It is an attempt to raise human beings to a higher level of existence where we are not alone when confronted by evil. Our ability to overcome evil comes through the power of love and holiness given us by God. Our deeds are the divine in disguise.

[Roosevelt] We are a mixed nation of many peoples and many religions, but most of us would accept the life of Christ as a pattern for our democratic way of life, and Christ taught love and never hate.

[Biographer comment on Hammarskjold] His sympathies for the human condition drew their inspiration straight from the ethics of the gospels.

[Hammarskjold] In the Sermon on the Mount, it is said that we should take no thought of the morrow. ... Can anything seem further from the planning, the long-term considerations of political life? And yet is this not the very expression of the kind of patience we must all learn to show in our work for peace and justice? Mustn't we learn to believe that when we give to this work, daily, what it is in our power to give, and when, daily, we meet the demands facing us to the best of our ability, this will ultimately lead to a world of greater justice and good will, even if nothing would seem to give us hope of success or even of progress in the right direction?

[Hammarskjold] Love thy neighbor as thyself; live together in peace; pursue universal brotherhood.

[Biographer comment on Addams] Tolstoy's message in *My Religion* changed her life. Jesus' teachings about forgiveness and love were crucial to her life. Do good to those who injure you. Never do anything counter to the law of love.

3. Seeking God's will in decision-making; reliance on faith to provide a vocation, direction, or path in life.

Leader talks about seeking God's will in decision-making; praying for guidance; refers to faith as a source for guidance in addressing ethical, moral questions and in determining a life path, vocation, or direction.

[JPPII] "I would go there often, walking along its paths in solitude and presenting to the Lord in prayer the various problems of the church, especially in the difficult times of the struggle against communism."

[JPII] On the moment of clarity of vocation: “One day I saw this with great clarity: it was like an interior illumination which brought with it the joy and certainty of a new vocation. And this awareness filled me with great inner peace.”

[Biographer comment on Heschel] For Heschel, a strong and consistent sense of purpose was “living in the sight of God.”

[Hammarskold] -- Pray that your loneliness may spur you into finding something to live for, something great enough to die for.

4. Belief in the spiritual value of suffering

Leader asserts that, through our own suffering, we develop compassion; points to faith as way to transform suffering into something worthwhile; refers to belief that suffering can lead to spiritual development.

[Roosevelt] Maybe that’s why God sends trials in life...so we may better understand the sufferings of others.

[Biographer comment on JPII] His suffering was transformed by faith – that was the lesson from his father.

[Mandela] Indeed, the chains of the body are often wings to the spirit. It has been so all along, and so it will always be. Shakespeare in *As You Like It* puts the same idea somewhat differently: Sweet are the uses of adversity; Which, like a toad, ugly and venomous; Wears yet a precious jewel in its head.

5. Evidence that leader approaches life with gratitude and hope, in good times and bad.

[Roosevelt] I am always aware of the importance of gratitude, thankfulness...even in hard times.

[Hammarskjold] Nobody can serve in this role [Secretary General of the UN] without a sense of gratitude for a task as deeply rewarding as it is exacting, as perennially inspiring as, sometimes, it may seem discouraging.

[Mandela] Hope is a powerful weapon even when nothing else may remain.

[Mandela] In spite of all that has happened I have, throughout the ebb and flow of the tides of fortune..., lived in hope and expectation. Sometimes I even have the belief that this feeling is part and parcel of myself. It seems to be woven into my being. I feel my heart pumping hope steadily to every part of my body, warming my blood and pepping up my spirits. I am convinced that floods of personal disaster can never drown a determined revolutionary nor can the cumulus of misery that accompanies tragedy suffocate him. To a freedom fighter, hope is what a life belt is to a swimmer - a guarantee that one will keep afloat and free from danger.

6. Commitment to make sacrifices for the sake of one’s faith

Leader asserts that sacrifice is needed in order to live up to the demands of faith and moral truth; that one must put one's life and personal choices on the line for one's beliefs; leader's own life is consistent with this belief.

[Bonhoeffer] Christianity entails decision, faith means making a decision, for there is no faith without obedience. Jesus required constant obedience.

[Bonhoeffer] We are not entitled to dream away the lifetime that is given to us.

[Bonhoeffer] When you are faithful to the earth for the sake of things above ... it dashes any hope for a comfortable life.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] He saw the role of religion as challenging people, making demands on them rather than as comforting them. Religion must challenge the status quo.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] Leader spoke about [the prophets'] breathless impatience with injustice.... The prophets had disdain for those to whom God was comfort and security; to them God was a challenge, an incessant demand. Tranquility is unknown in the soul of a prophet. The miseries of the world give him no rest.

[Mandela] For one thing, those who have no soul, no sense of national pride and no ideals to win can suffer neither humiliation nor defeat; they can evolve no national heritage, are inspired by no sacred mission and can produce no martyrs or national heroes. A new world will be won not by those who stand at a distance with their arms folded, but by those who are in the arena, whose garments are torn by storms and whose bodies are maimed in the course of contest. Honour belongs to those who never forsake the truth even when things seem dark and grim, who try over and over again, who are never discouraged by insults, humiliation and even defeat.

7. Attitude of non-attachment to the fruits of action

Leader asserts that, when working for peace, justice, or social change, one should take action and then surrender the results to God or faith in what will be. After making a difficult decision as best one can, entrust the results to God.

[Hammarskjold] You cannot grip the world and shape it as a material thing. You can only influence its development if you recognize and respect it as a thing of the spirit.

[Hammarskjold] The Bhagavad-Gita echoes somewhere an experience of all ages and all philosophies in these words: Work with anxiety about results is far inferior to work without such anxiety, in calm self-surrender. .. [these words] express a deep faith. We will be happy if we can make that faith ours in all our efforts.

[Hammarskjold] ... [O]ur work for peace should be pursued with the patience of one who has no anxiety about results, acting in the calm self-surrender of faith.

[Bonhoeffer] ... one only learns to have faith by living in the full this-worldiness of life. If one has completely renounced making something of oneself ... then one throws oneself completely into the arms of god So I am thinking gratefully and with peace of mind about past as well as

present things [DB's comment about his notable calm in prison the day after the failure of the final and very promising coup attempt against Hitler, this failure ensuring DB's execution].

8. Faith as a source of serenity, courage, patience, persistence in the face of challenges; faith as source of sense of order and direction

Leader describes faith as a source of serenity and courage in the face of extreme circumstances, danger, death; argues that the surrender of the self to faith gives peace; direct contact with the sacred provides an experience of peace and joy; faith is one's only firm basis for serenity and courage; courage requires letting go of a self-protective attitude, surrendering the self to faith. Faith makes possible patient persistence toward the good, a sense of order and direction in life, a sense of meaning in life.

[Biographer comment on Bonhoeffer] [Even facing a death sentence, because of his faith in God], he emanated calm.

[Bonhoeffer] I am speaking of the calm of the mystic, which comes from the experience of the ultimate.

[Bonhoeffer] From his experience [of relying on his faith while] in prison, he said now he knew there was nothing in life of which one need ever be afraid.

[Bonhoeffer] [Faith provides peace even when we see through] ... the human illusion that we can organize our lives so as to make ourselves safe from all strikes of fate.

[Bonhoeffer] [Comment by surviving fellow prisoner – (At the end)] he was cheerful, ready to respond to a joke, and apparently care free. I am sure he went to his death in just such a spirit. In a sense he was materially disembodied.

[Biographer comment on JPII] But it is precisely this rootedness [in faith] that has allowed him to proclaim, without hesitation or fear of hypocrisy, "Be not afraid." His life, forged in the furnace of the great political and intellectual conflicts of the twentieth century, is an embodiment of that proclamation, just as his teaching is an explanation of the sources of his fearlessness and his public ministry is the action implied by it. The ground on which he makes that proclamation, which is universal in intention, is the conviction that Jesus Christ is the answer to the question that is every human life.

[Hammarskjöld] [Establishing world peace requires] the courage to meet others with trust – he who fears God will no longer fear men.

[Biographer comment on Hammarskjöld] His commitment ultimately depends on his commitment to God. ... To be united with God, to be in his hands, means to rest in his stillness, to receive strength and inspiration from him, to be liberated by him, and to live in freedom This union is to be realized in the service of men.

[Mandela] [The story of Christ's crucifixion] is as meaningful today as it was at the height of the Roman Empire. After the trial, Pilate writes to a friend in Rome to whom he makes remarkable confessions. Briefly, this is the story as told by him and, for convenience, I have put it in the first person. "As governor of a Roman province I have tried many cases involving all types of rebels.

But this trial [of] Christ I shall never forget! One day a huge crowd, literally shivering with rage and excitement, assembled just outside my palace and demanded that I crucify Christ, at the same time pointing to a man whose arms and feet were heavily chained. I looked at the prisoner and our eyes met. In the midst of all the excitement and noise, he remained perfectly calm, quiet and confident as if he had millions of people on his side.”

[Biographer comment on Addams] Leader believed, with Matthew Arnold, that if a person trusted his own conscience, he would experience Christ’s secret of peace, calm, sense of restful centeredness.

9. Reported experiences of direct connection with God or the sacred dimensions of life; faith as a felt relationship to a personal, living God.

Leader refers to experiences of direct connection with God, the ineffable, a mystical connection, silence, experience of sacredness, cultivation of awe, reverence, mysticism, and the like.

[Heschel] Mystical encounter – at least caught a glimpse of the beauty, peace, power, that flow through the souls of those who are devoted to Him. Cultivate awe ... a sense of wonder in the face of all existence. Intellect is overwhelmed in the face of mystery. Jewish education should unlock the reverence and awe. Replete is the world with spiritual radiance ... [to miss this is] to dim all wonder by indifference.

[Heschel] To sense God in the small things ... the ultimate in the common and simple. ... to feel in the rush of the passing the stillness of the eternal; the ineffable inhabits both the magnificent and the common Acts of worship counteract the trivialization of existence.

[PPII] His introduction to mysticism was being a part of the “living rosary,” his personal encounter with God.

[Hammarskjold] [He saw the meditation room he created as a] center of stillness surrounded by silence; the sense in a vessel is not in its shell but in its void.

[Hammarskjold] God does not die, etc but we die on the day when our lives cease to be illuminated by the steady radiance, renewed daily, of a wonder, the source of which is beyond all reason.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] He demanded faith in a personal god – unlike his contemporaries who had an antipathy to supernaturalism. He was very critical of psychological and sociological (reductionistic) explanations of religious strivings.

[Heschel] Faith is not a notion or an ideology or a system of ideas but a relationship with a very real god.

10. Disposition towards forgiveness, reconciliation, or tolerance

Leader shows evidence of a sustained willingness to forgive others for their transgressions; forgiveness, tolerance, or reconciliation as central values driving behavior.

[Biographer comment on Mandela] He understood that democracy could not move forward without forgiveness and reconciliation.

[Biographer on JP II] He celebrated Mass in his [hospital] room, and taped messages to the faithful, to be played in St. Peter's Square, starting with the first one on May 18, the fifth day after the shooting and his sixty- first birthday. In it, John Paul II said: "I am praying for the brother who wounded me and whom I sincerely forgive."

11. Leader refers to the importance of prayer, meditation, Bible reading, and other spiritual practices in his/her life.

[Bonhoeffer] [In the most extreme circumstances, he relied on] a daily practice of meditation (on bible passages). Without this [immersion in bible passages], I couldn't live anymore.

[Heschel] [Having established practices of prayer] reminds the distraught mind that it is time to think of God, time to disregard my ego. Prayer is too grave to depend on impulse.

[Roosevelt] [Flag Day, 1942] The President read Mr. Stephen Vincent Benet's beautiful prayer, which I am giving in part in the hope that all will cut it out and keep it with them. "God of the free, we pledge our lives and hearts today to the cause of all free mankind. Grant us victory over the tyrants who would enslave all free men and nations. Grant us faith and understanding to cherish all those who fight freedom as if they were our brothers. Grant us brotherhood in hope and union, not only for the space of this bitter war, but for the days to come which shall and must unite all the children of earth. Our earth is but a small star in the great universe. Yet of it we can make, if we choose, a planet unvexed by war, untroubled by hunger or fear, undivided by senseless distinctions of race, color or theory. Grant us that courage and foreseeing to begin this task today that our children and our children's children may be proud of the name of man... Yet most of all grant us brotherhood, not only for this day but for all our years-a brotherhood not of words but of acts and deeds. We are all of us children of earth-grant us that simple knowledge. If our brothers are oppressed, then we are oppressed. If they hunger we hunger. If their freedom is taken away our freedom is not secure. Grant us a common faith that man shall know bread and peace-that he shall know justice and righteousness, freedom and security, an equal opportunity and an equal chance to do his best, not only in our own lands, but throughout the world. And in that faith let us march toward the clean world our hands can make. Amen.

[JP II] The spiritual experiences (of Marian devotion) were fundamental in shaping *that journey of prayer and contemplation* which gradually brought me to the priesthood.

[JP II] [took Holy Communion on a regular basis] "The sacrament gave me a sense of inner quiet and calm. I am just an ordinary person interested in trying to make sense of the mysteries of life."

12. Belief in the sacredness and fundamental rights of all persons

Leader refers to a belief in the sacredness of each human being; human rights as rooted in faith; understanding of and commitment to freedom of religion as a basic human right that needs to be protected.

[Bonhoeffer] Human rights are rooted in the ascription of liberty, equality, and respect to every human being. ... [He had argued that] the untrammelled pursuit of truth and basic rights with an unconditional and universal reach are moral treasures to be guarded.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] Heschel sought to promote a sacred humanism, a global reverence for all individuals. Living in a manner compatible with God's presence must be accompanied by a radical sense of human dignity... He believed that detachment was the problem keeping whites from embracing the cause of what he described as universal human dignity.

[Eulagist's comment on Heschel] Heschel's love for, even veneration of, all human beings was the most palpable motive of his impassioned social action.

[Roosevelt] [On UN Declaration of Human Rights] "I would have been delighted to see in the preamble a paragraph alluding to the Supreme Power...."

[Biographer comment on JPII] His teachings, including those on communism and on sexuality, were coming from the same fundamental truths about human dignity

[JPII] [On influence of his experiences with Nazism and communism] "And so it is easy to understand my deep concern for the dignity of every human person and the need to respect human rights, beginning with the right to life. This concern shaped in the first years of my priesthood and has grown stronger over time. It is also easy to understand my concern for the family and young people. These concerns are all interwoven; they developed precisely as a result of those tragic experiences."

[Hammaraskjold] The UN Charter [reflects a recognition of] the dignity and worth of the human person, to live together in peace as good neighbors; recognized in the religion of the questioner as the will of God – love thy neighbor as thyself. The UN stands outside all confessions but it is, nevertheless, an instrument of faith. ...it is inspired by what unites and not by what divides the great religions of the world. Faith in the dignity and worth of men, born equal. ... chance to live a full life of freedom.

13. Stated recognition of value of a community of the faithful

Leader articulates a central benefit of religious participation as being part of a community of the faithful, which brings a collective spirit of faith to people working together toward the good.

[Bonhoeffer] We're part of a fellowship of saints, a social community.

[Mandela] What has sustained me even in the most grim moments is the knowledge that I am a member of a tried and tested family which has triumphed over many difficulties. ... This fact endows my spirits with powerful wings.

14. *Leader offers a critique of conventional religious practices as having become obsolete or ossified, calling for renewal of religious institutions and practices.*

[Biographer comment on Heschel] In the tradition of the prophets, about whom he wrote, he is a critic of institutionalized religion, contemporary religion as dull, irrelevant, insipid. In his view, it needs to be a living fountain instead of an heirloom. He took a stand against the thoughtless performance of rituals.

[Heschel] Religion has often suffered from the tendency to become an end in itself, to seclude the holy, to become parochial, self-indulgent, self-seeking; as if the task were not to ennoble human nature but to enhance the power and beauty of its institutions or to enlarge the body of doctrines.

15. *Advocates for the role of religion in public life*

Leader argues for the important role of religion in public life; believes that the voice of religious, spiritual, and moral leaders should be influential in society; that spiritual force is one potential contributor to social justice and the pursuit of what's right and good; refers to his/her allegiance to the church as an institution that has an important place in society, that has done and can do good.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] He was also very involved with the place of religion in public life, an authentic biblical voice for social change.

[Biographer comment on Heschel] He was concerned with the role of religion in a free society. There are two spheres of action, piety and political responsibility. He wanted to interpret the religious significance of current issues.

[Roosevelt] I have a great belief in a spiritual force, but I think we have to realize that spiritual force alone has to have material force with it so long as we live in a material world. The two together make a strong combination [for social justice].

[Mandela] Equally important was the position of the church, which I associated not so much with the body and doctrine contained in the Bible but with the person of Reverend M...the fact that in spiritual matters he was the regent's superior, so that stressed the enormous power of the church. What was more was that all the progress my people had made... (was) all the product of missionary schools.

[Mandela] I addressed that meeting of the Ministers' Interdenominational Society... what I was saying was to stress the *role* of the church in the struggle and to say that, just as the [individuals in power] use the pulpit in order to propagate their views, our priests should do exactly the same.

16. *Leader contributes to ecumenical communication and/or pluralistic perspective on faith and religion.*

[Biographer comment on Heschel] In order to develop the capacity for religion to influence public life toward peace and justice, it was important to draw people together across different religious traditions. This included relationships between Jews, Catholics, Protestants, eventually ... Muslims.

[Roosevelt] Her moral obligations were coming out of a commitment to humanity, not particular religious backgrounds.

[Biographer comment on JPII (Karol Wojtyla)] The archbishop of Krakow's first intervention on the subject, on September 25, 1964, addressed religious freedom as an ecumenical issue as well as a Church-state question. Weaving back and forth between the ecumenical and public policy sides of the question, he laid out a sophisticated position, most elements of which would find their way into the *Declaration on Religious Freedom* the following year.

[Biographer comment on JPII] He offered an invitation to Protestant and Orthodox Christians to “help him think through the kind of papacy that could serve them in the future.”

[Hammarskjold] [Christian Churches] should not separate those of Christian faith from others but should instead be that element in their lives which enables them to stretch out their hands to peoples of other creeds in the feeling of universal brotherhood....

[Biographer comment on Mandela] attended all church services available in the prison, “listening with equal attention to the sermons by Catholic, Hindu, Muslim, and Dutch Reformed Church priests... Though brought up in the Methodist Church and still regarding himself as a staunch member, he favored a broad attitude toward religion.

17. **Counter-indicator** – *Immobilizing nihilism, meaninglessness, alienation, or spiritual despair.*

Case studies for this project did not include examples of this.